Medical Coverage Policy | Autografts and Allografts in the Treatment of Focal Articular Cartilage Lesions

EFFECTIVE DATE: 10|01|2022
POLICY LAST UPDATED: 06|15|2022

OVERVIEW
Osteochondral grafts are used to repair full-thickness chondral defects involving a joint. In the case of osteochondral autografts, 1 or more small osteochondral plugs are harvested from non-weight-bearing sites, usually from the knee, and press fit into a prepared site in the lesion. Osteochondral allografts are typically used for larger lesions. Autologous or allogeneic minced cartilage, decellularized osteochondral allograft plugs, and reduced osteochondral allograft discs are also being evaluated as a treatment of articular cartilage lesions.

MEDICAL CRITERIA
Not applicable

PRIOR AUTHORIZATION
Prior Authorization is not required

POLICY STATEMENT
Medicare Advantage Plans and Commercial Products
Allografting
Fresh osteochondral allografting is covered as a technique to repair full-thickness chondral defects of the knee, large (area >1.5 cm2) or cystic (volume >3.0 cm3) osteochondral lesions of the talus or osteochondral lesions of the talus when autografting would be inadequate due to lesion size, depth or location.

Osteochondral allografting for all other joints are not covered for Medicare Advantage Plans and not medically necessary for Commercial Products as the evidence is insufficient to determine the effects of the technology on health outcomes.

Autografting
Osteochondral autografting, using one or more cores of osteochondral tissue, is covered for full thickness cartilage defects of the knee or osteochondral lesions of the talus.

Osteochondral autografting for all other joints are not covered for Medicare Advantage Plans and not medically necessary Commercial Products as the evidence is insufficient to determine the effects of the technology on health outcomes.

Other Treatments
The following treatments of focal articular cartilage lesions are considered not covered for Medicare Advantage Plans and not medically necessary for Commercial Products as the evidence is insufficient to determine the effects of the technology on health outcomes:

- Autologous minced or particulated cartilage
- Allogeneic minced or particulated cartilage
- Decellularized osteochondral allograft plugs (eg, Chondrofix)
- Reduced osteochondral allograft discs (eg, ProChondrix, Cartiform)

COVERAGE
Benefits may vary between groups and contracts. Please refer to the appropriate Benefit Booklet, Evidence of Coverage or Subscriber Agreement for applicable surgery benefits/coverage.

BACKGROUND

For individuals who have full-thickness articular cartilage lesions of the knee who receive an osteochondral autograft, the evidence includes randomized controlled trials (RCTs), systematic reviews of RCTs, and longer-term observational studies. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment-related morbidity. Several systematic reviews have evaluated osteochondral autografting for cartilage repair in the short- and mid-term. Compared with abrasion techniques (eg, microfracture, drilling), there is evidence that osteochondral autografting decreases failure rates and improves outcomes in patients with medium-size lesions (eg, 2-6 cm2) when measured at longer follow-up. This is believed to be due to the higher durability of hyaline cartilage compared with fibrocartilage from abrasion techniques. There appears to be a relatively narrow range of lesion size for which osteochondral autografting is most effective. The best results have also been observed with lesions on the femoral condyles, although treatment of lesions on the trochlea and patella may also improve outcomes. Correction of malalignment is important for the success of the procedure. The evidence suggests that osteochondral autografts may be considered an option for moderate-sized, symptomatic, full thickness, chondral lesions of the femoral condyle, trochlea, or patella. The evidence is sufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

For individuals who have full-thickness articular cartilage lesions of the knee when autografting would be inadequate due to lesion size, location, or depth who receive a fresh osteochondral allograft, the evidence includes case series and systematic reviews of case series. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment related morbidity. Due to the lack of alternatives, this procedure may be considered a salvage operation in younger patients for full-thickness chondral defects of the knee caused by acute or repetitive trauma when other cartilage repair techniques (eg, microfracture, osteochondral autografting, autologous chondrocyte implantation) would be inadequate due to lesion size, location, or depth. The evidence is sufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

For individuals who have full-thickness articular cartilage lesions of the knee, ankle, elbow, or shoulder who receive autologous or allogeneic minced or particulated articular cartilage, the evidence includes a small RCT and small case series. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment-related morbidity. The evidence on autologous minced cartilage includes a small RCT. The evidence on allogeneic juvenile minced cartilage includes a few small case series. The case series have suggested an improvement in outcomes compared with preoperative measures, but there is also evidence of subchondral edema, nonhomogeneous surface, graft hypertrophy, and delamination. For articular cartilage lesions of the knee, further evidence, preferably from RCTs, is needed to evaluate the effect on health outcomes compared with other procedures. There are fewer options for articular cartilage lesions of the ankle. However, further study in a larger number of patients is needed to assess the short- and long-term effectiveness of this technology. The evidence is insufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

For individuals who have full-thickness articular cartilage lesions of the knee, ankle, elbow, or shoulder who receive decellularized osteochondral allograft plugs, the evidence includes small case series. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment-related morbidity. The case series reported delamination of the implants and high failure rates. The evidence is insufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

For individuals who have full-thickness articular cartilage lesions of the knee, ankle, elbow, or shoulder who receive reduced osteochondral allograft discs, the evidence includes very small case series. Relevant outcomes are symptoms, functional outcomes, quality of life, and treatment-related morbidity. The evidence is insufficient to determine that the technology results in an improvement in the net health outcome.

CODING

Medicare Advantage Plans and Commercial Products

The following surgery code(s) are considered medically necessary when filed with any of the ICD-10 Diagnosis* codes listed below:

27415 Osteochondral allograft, knee, open
27416 Osteochondral autograft(s), knee, open (eg, mosaicplasty) (includes harvesting of autograft[s])
28446 Open osteochondral autograft, talus (includes obtaining graft[s])
29866 Arthroscopy, knee, surgical; osteochondral autograft(s) (eg, mosaicplasty) includes harvesting of the autograft[s])
29867 Arthroscopy, knee, surgical; osteochondral allograft (eg, mosaicplasty)

***ICD-10 Diagnosis codes:**
M12.561-M12.569
M17.0-M17.9
M23.8x1-M23.92
M25.861-M25.869
M85.671-M85.679
M89.8x6
M93.261-M93.269
M93.271-M93.279
M94.261-M94.269
M94.8x6
M94.9
S89.80xA-S89.82xS
S89.90xA-S89.92xS

RELATED POLICIES
Not applicable

PUBLISHED
Provider Update, August 2022
Provider Update, July 2021
Provider Update, July 2020
Provider Update December 2019
Provider Update, November 2018

REFERENCES:.
1. Durur-Subasi I, Durur-Karakaya A, Yildirim OS. Osteochondral Lesions of Major Joints. Eurasian J Med. Jun 2015; 47(2): 138-44. PMID 26180500
2. Fortin PT, Balazsy JE. Talus fractures: evaluation and treatment. J Am Acad Orthop Surg. Mar-Apr 2001; 9(2): 114-27. PMID 11281635
3. Mithoefer K, McAdams T, Williams RJ, et al. Clinical efficacy of the microfracture technique for articular cartilagerepair in the knee: an evidence-based systematic analysis. Am J Sports Med. Oct 2009; 37(10): 2053-63. PMID 19251676
4. Solheim E, Hegna J, Inderhaug E, et al. Results at 10-14 years after microfracture treatment of articular cartilage defects in the knee. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. May 2016; 24(5): 1587-93. PMID 25416965
5. Reddy S, Pedowitz DI, Parekh SG, et al. The morbidity associated with osteochondral harvest from asymptomatic knees for the treatment of osteochondral lesions of the talus. Am J Sports Med. Jan 2007; 35(1): 80-5. PMID 16957009
6. Hangody L, Kish G, Modis L, et al. Mosaicplasty for the treatment of osteochondritis dissecans of the talus: two to seven year results in 36 patients. Foot Ankle Int. Jul 2001; 22(7): 552-8. PMID 11503979

7. Zamborsky R, Danisovic L. Surgical Techniques for Knee Cartilage Repair: An Updated Large-Scale Systematic Review and Network Meta-analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials. Arthroscopy. Mar 2020; 36(3): 845-858. PMID 32139062
8. Gracitelli GC, Moraes VY, Franciozi CE, et al. Surgical interventions (microfracture, drilling, mosaicplasty, and allograft transplantation) for treating isolated cartilage defects of the knee in adults. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. Sep 03 2016; 9: CD010675. PMID 27590275
9. Magnussen RA, Dunn WR, Carey JL, et al. Treatment of focal articular cartilage defects in the knee: a systematic review. Clin Orthop Relat Res. Apr 2008; 466(4): 952-62. PMID 18196358
10. Pareek A, Reardon PJ, Macalena JA, et al. Osteochondral Autograft Transfer Versus Microfracture in the Knee: A Meta-analysis of Prospective Comparative Studies at Midterm. Arthroscopy. Oct 2016; 32(10): 2118-2130. PMID 27487736
11. Harris JD, Cavo M, Brophy R, et al. Biological knee reconstruction: a systematic review of combined meniscal allograft transplantation and cartilage repair or restoration. Arthroscopy. Mar 2011; 27(3): 409-18. PMID 21030203
12. Hangody L, Kish G, Karpati Z, et al. Arthroscopic autogenous osteochondral mosaicplasty for the treatment of femoral condylar articular defects. A preliminary report. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. 1997; 5(4): 262-7. PMID 9430578
13. Hangody L, Kish G, Karpati Z, et al. Mosaicplasty for the treatment of articular cartilage defects: application in clinical practice. Orthopedics. Jul 1998; 21(7): 751-6. PMID 9672912
14. Hangody L, Vasarhelyi G, Hangody LR, et al. Autologous osteochondral grafting--technique and long-term results. Injury. Apr 2008; 39 Suppl 1: S32-9. PMID 18313470
15. Solheim E, Hegna J, Oyen J, et al. Osteochondral autografting (mosaicplasty) in articular cartilage defects in the knee: results at 5 to 9 years. Knee. Jan 2010; 17(1): 84-7. PMID 19666226
16. Solheim E, Hegna J, Oyen J, et al. Results at 10 to 14 years after osteochondral autografting (mosaicplasty) in articular cartilage defects in the knee. Knee. Aug 2013; 20(4): 287-90. PMID 23482060
17. Marcacci M, Kon E, Delcogliano M, et al. Arthroscopic autologous osteochondral grafting for cartilage defects of the knee: prospective study results at a minimum 7-year follow-up. Am J Sports Med. Dec 2007; 35(12): 2014-21. PMID 17724094
18. Astur DC, Arliani GG, Binz M, et al. Autologous osteochondral transplantation for treating patellar chondral injuries: evaluation, treatment, and outcomes of a two-year follow-up study. J Bone Joint Surg Am. May 21 2014; 96(10): 816-23. PMID 24875022
19. Nho SJ, Foo LF, Green DM, et al. Magnetic resonance imaging and clinical evaluation of patellar resurfacing with press-fit osteochondral autograft plugs. Am J Sports Med. Jun 2008; 36(6): 1101-9. PMID 18337357
20. Kunze KN, Ramkumar PN, Manzi JE, et al. Risk Factors for Failure After Osteochondral Allograft Transplantation of the Knee: A Systematic Review and Exploratory Meta-analysis. Am J Sports Med. Jan 20 2022: 3635465211063901. PMID 35049404
21. Merkely G, Ogura T, Ackermann J, et al. Clinical Outcomes after Revision of Autologous Chondrocyte Implantation to Osteochondral Allograft Transplantation for Large Chondral Defects: A Comparative Matched-Group Analysis. Cartilage. Apr 2021; 12(2): 155-161. PMID 30897940
22. De Caro F, Bisicchia S, Amendola A, et al. Large fresh osteochondral allografts of the knee: a systematic clinical and basic science review of the literature. Arthroscopy. Apr 2015; 31(4): 757-65. PMID 25660010
23. Chui K, Jeys L, Snow M. Knee salvage procedures: The indications, techniques and outcomes of large osteochondral allografts. World J Orthop. Apr 18 2015; 6(3): 340-50. PMID 25893177
24. Nielsen ES, McCauley JC, Pulido PA, et al. Return to Sport and Recreational Activity After Osteochondral Allograft Transplantation in the Knee. Am J Sports Med. Jun 2017; 45(7): 1608-1614. PMID 28375642

25. Gracitelli GC, Meric G, Briggs DT, et al. Fresh osteochondral allografts in the knee: comparison of primary transplantation versus transplantation after failure of previous subchondral marrow stimulation. Am J Sports Med. Apr 2015; 43(4): 885-91. PMID 25817190
26. Zengerink M, Struijs PA, Tol JL, et al. Treatment of osteochondral lesions of the talus: a systematic review. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. Feb 2010; 18(2): 238-46. PMID 19859695
27. Gobbi A, Francisco RA, Lubowitz JH, et al. Osteochondral lesions of the talus: randomized controlled trialcomparing chondroplasty, microfracture, and osteochondral autograft transplantation. Arthroscopy. Oct 2006; 22(10): 1085-92. PMID 17027406
28. Choi WJ, Park KK, Kim BS, et al. Osteochondral lesion of the talus: is there a critical defect size for poor outcome?. Am J Sports Med. Oct 2009; 37(10): 1974-80. PMID 19654429
29. Chuckpaiwong B, Berkson EM, Theodore GH. Microfracture for osteochondral lesions of the ankle: outcome analysis and outcome predictors of 105 cases. Arthroscopy. Jan 2008; 24(1): 106-12. PMID 18182210
30. Cuttica DJ, Smith WB, Hyer CF, et al. Osteochondral lesions of the talus: predictors of clinical outcome. Foot Ankle Int. Nov 2011; 32(11): 1045-51. PMID 22338953
31. Ramponi L, Yasui Y, Murawski CD, et al. Lesion Size Is a Predictor of Clinical Outcomes After Bone Marrow Stimulation for Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus: A Systematic Review. Am J Sports Med. Jun 2017; 45(7): 1698-1705. PMID 27852595
32. Haleem AM, Ross KA, Smyth NA, et al. Double-Plug Autologous Osteochondral Transplantation Shows Equal Functional Outcomes Compared With Single-Plug Procedures in Lesions of the Talar Dome: A Minimum 5-Year Clinical Follow-up. Am J Sports Med. Aug 2014; 42(8): 1888-95. PMID 24948585
33. Shimozono Y, Hurley ET, Nguyen JT, et al. Allograft Compared with Autograft in Osteochondral Transplantation for the Treatment of Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus. J Bone Joint Surg Am. Nov 07 2018; 100(21): 1838-1844. PMID 30399078
34. Yoon HS, Park YJ, Lee M, et al. Osteochondral Autologous Transplantation Is Superior to Repeat Arthroscopy for the Treatment of Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus After Failed Primary Arthroscopic Treatment. Am J Sports Med. Aug 2014; 42(8): 1896-903. PMID 24907287
35. Imhoff AB, Paul J, Ottinger B, et al. Osteochondral transplantation of the talus: long-term clinical and magnetic resonance imaging evaluation. Am J Sports Med. Jul 2011; 39(7): 1487-93. PMID 21372316
36. Kreuz PC, Steinwachs M, Erggelet C, et al. Mosaicplasty with autogenous talar autograft for osteochondral lesions of the talus after failed primary arthroscopic management: a prospective study with a 4-year follow-up. Am J Sports Med. Jan 2006; 34(1): 55-63. PMID 16157849
37. Georgiannos D, Bisbinas I, Badekas A. Osteochondral transplantation of autologous graft for the treatment of osteochondral lesions of talus: 5- to 7-year follow-up. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. Dec 2016; 24(12): 3722-3729. PMID 25326766
38. Pereira GF, Steele JR, Fletcher AN, et al. Fresh Osteochondral Allograft Transplantation for Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus: A Systematic Review. J Foot Ankle Surg. May-Jun 2021; 60(3): 585-591. PMID 33642164
39. Diniz P, Pacheco J, Flora M, et al. Clinical applications of allografts in foot and ankle surgery. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. Jun 2019; 27(6): 1847-1872. PMID 30721345
40. van Dijk CN. Editorial Commentary: Bulk Osteochondral Talar Grafts Compromise Future Arthrodesis or Prosthesis. Arthroscopy. Jan 2017; 33(1): 223-224. PMID 28003071
41. VanTienderen RJ, Dunn JC, Kusnezov N, et al. Osteochondral Allograft Transfer for Treatment of Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus: A Systematic Review. Arthroscopy. Jan 2017; 33(1): 217-222. PMID 27546173
42. Ahmad J, Jones K. Comparison of Osteochondral Autografts and Allografts for Treatment of Recurrent or Large Talar Osteochondral Lesions. Foot Ankle Int. Jan 2016; 37(1): 40-50. PMID 26333683

43. Gaul F, Tirico LEP, McCauley JC, et al. Osteochondral Allograft Transplantation for Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus: Midterm Follow-up. Foot Ankle Int. Feb 2019; 40(2): 202-209. PMID 30383977
44. Sayani J, Plotkin T, Burchette DT, et al. Treatment Strategies and Outcomes for Osteochondritis Dissecans of the Capitellum. Am J Sports Med. Dec 2021; 49(14): 4018-4029. PMID 33886390
45. Westermann RW, Hancock KJ, Buckwalter JA, et al. Return to Sport After Operative Management of Osteochondritis Dissecans of the Capitellum: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. Orthop J Sports Med. Jun 2016; 4(6): 2325967116654651. PMID 27482526
46. Kirsch JM, Thomas JR, Khan M, et al. Return to Play After Osteochondral Autograft Transplantation of the Capitellum: A Systematic Review. Arthroscopy. Jul 2017; 33(7): 1412-1420.e1. PMID 28413129
47. Sato K, Iwamoto T, Matsumura N, et al. Costal Osteochondral Autograft for Advanced Osteochondritis Dissecans of the Humeral Capitellum in Adolescent and Young Adult Athletes: Clinical Outcomes with a Mean Follow-up of 4.8 Years. J Bone Joint Surg Am. Jun 06 2018; 100(11): 903-913. PMID 29870440
48. Bexkens R, Ogink PT, Doornberg JN, et al. Donor-site morbidity after osteochondral autologous transplantation for osteochondritis dissecans of the capitellum: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc. Jul 2017; 25(7): 2237-2246. PMID 28391550
49. Kircher J, Patzer T, Magosch P, et al. Osteochondral autologous transplantation for the treatment of full-thickness cartilage defects of the shoulder: results at nine years. J Bone Joint Surg Br. Apr 2009; 91(4): 499-503. PMID 19336811
50. Cole BJ, Farr J, Winalski CS, et al. Outcomes after a single-stage procedure for cell-based cartilage repair: a prospective clinical safety trial with 2-year follow-up. Am J Sports Med. Jun 2011; 39(6): 1170-9. PMID 21460066
51. Farr J, Tabet SK, Margerrison E, et al. Clinical, Radiographic, and Histological Outcomes After Cartilage Repair With Particulated Juvenile Articular Cartilage: A 2-Year Prospective Study. Am J Sports Med. Jun 2014; 42(6): 1417-25. PMID 24718790
52. Tompkins M, Hamann JC, Diduch DR, et al. Preliminary results of a novel single-stage cartilage restoration technique: particulated juvenile articular cartilage allograft for chondral defects of the patella. Arthroscopy. Oct 2013; 29(10): 1661-70. PMID 23876608
53. Dawkins BJ, Shubin Stein BE, Mintz DN, et al. Patellofemoral joint cartilage restoration with particulated juvenile allograft in patients under 21 years old. Knee. Aug 07 2021. PMID 34376348
54. Saltzman BM, Lin J, Lee S. Particulated Juvenile Articular Cartilage Allograft Transplantation for Osteochondral Talar Lesions. Cartilage. Jan 2017; 8(1): 61-72. PMID 27994721
55. Bleazey S, Brigido SA. Reconstruction of complex osteochondral lesions of the talus with cylindrical sponge allograft and particulate juvenile cartilage graft: provisional results with a short-term follow-up. Foot Ankle Spec. Oct 2012; 5(5): 300-5. PMID 22935411
56. Coetzee JC, Giza E, Schon LC, et al. Treatment of osteochondral lesions of the talus with particulated juvenile cartilage. Foot Ankle Int. Sep 2013; 34(9): 1205-11. PMID 23576118
57. Dekker TJ, Steele JR, Federer AE, et al. Efficacy of Particulated Juvenile Cartilage Allograft Transplantation for Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus. Foot Ankle Int. Mar 2018; 39(3): 278-283. PMID 29262723
58. DeSandis BA, Haleem AM, Sofka CM, et al. Arthroscopic Treatment of Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus Using Juvenile Articular Cartilage Allograft and Autologous Bone Marrow Aspirate Concentration. J Foot Ankle Surg. Mar 2018; 57(2): 273-280. PMID 29305041
59. Farr J, Gracitelli GC, Shah N, et al. High Failure Rate of a Decellularized Osteochondral Allograft for the Treatment of Cartilage Lesions. Am J Sports Med. Aug 2016; 44(8): 2015-22. PMID 27179056
60. Johnson CC, Johnson DJ, Garcia GH, et al. High Short-Term Failure Rate Associated With Decellularized Osteochondral Allograft for Treatment of Knee Cartilage Lesions. Arthroscopy. Dec 2017; 33(12): 2219-2227. PMID 28967543

61. American Orhopaedic Foot and Ankle Society. Position Statement: The Use of Osteochondral Transplantation for the Treatment of Osteochondral Lesions of the Talus. https://www.aofas.org/docs/default-source/research-andpolicy/osteochondral-lesions-position-statement.pdf?sfvrsn=95e8c93b_2. Accessed March 8, 2022.
62. Smyth NA, Murawski CD, Adams SB, et al. Osteochondral Allograft: Proceedings of the International Consensus Meeting on Cartilage Repair of the Ankle. Foot Ankle Int. Jul 2018; 39(1_suppl): 35S-40S. PMID 30215308
63. American Academy of Orthopaedic Surgeons Diagnosis and Treatment of Osteochondritis Dissecans Work Group. The diagnosis and treatment of osteochondritis dissecans: Guideline and evidence report. 2010, December4ttps://aaos.org/globalassets/quality-and-practice-resources/osteochondritisoissecans/osteochondritis-dissecanclinical-practice-guideline.pdf. Accessed March 8, 2022.
64. Chambers HG, Shea KG, Anderson AF, et al. American Academy of Orthopaedic Surgeons clinical practice guideline on: the diagnosis and treatment of osteochondritis dissecans. J Bone Joint Surg Am. Jul 18 2012; 94(14): 1322-4. PMID 22810404
65. Trice ME, Bugbee WD, Greenwald AS, et al. Articular cartilage restoration: A review of currently available methods. 2010; http://orl-inc.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Cartilage-Repair-2010.pdf. Accessed March 8, 2022.
66. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence. Mosaicplasty for symptomatic articular defects of the knee [IPG607]. https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ipg607. Accessed March 8, 2022.